B.3: Talking Points — Responding to others’ privacy expectations

For many people, personal privacy is deeply emotional and its real or perceived absence may leave them feeling vulnerable, exposed, or out of control. This is why trust and transparency are essential to building successful and sustainable IDS, and why IDS must try to fully understand and appreciate their community’s perspectives about how and when to use data appropriately. There may be a variety of reasons that community members support or object to a particular use case. Listening to community members’ voices and responding to them are two different skills and workstreams, and IDS should learn to do both.

Key strategies and messages:

› Understand that community expectations and preferences surrounding privacy are diverse.
  - We know that privacy risks impact different groups in different ways, and we are prioritizing a variety of inclusive public engagement opportunities to be sure we are hearing from diverse voices.
  - We know that not everyone will agree about how data should or should not be used, and before we go forward we want to have a conversation about our community values and priorities.
  - It is important to our IDS that this community generally agrees with how we are proposing to use integrated data and feels comfortable with the process.

› Anticipate pushback to data-driven initiatives.
  - Feeling out of control - e.g., “Why can’t I opt out,” “Who decided that this was going to be good for me?” and potential responses:
    » The IDS’ work is valuable because it is a snapshot of the entire community, and would be less effective and unrepresentative if some community members’ information was not included.
    » Our privacy laws specifically permit this use of data, because our legislatures recognized the value of this kind of evaluation to improve government services.
    » Community members have a voice and will be included through our public engagement activities, and the final outcome will reflect that.
    » There is a data governance body that sets transparent policies and procedures for data use. The governance board is made up of ________________ and our policies and procedures can be found here: ________________.
  - Mistrust of research - e.g., “I don’t want to be a guinea pig,” and potential responses:
    » Using administrative data to evaluate potential solutions to community issues actually means we do not need to collect more data or conduct intrusive experiments to better understand our community.
    » Analysts using the IDS only receive aggregated and de-identified data so that researchers cannot identify particular individuals.
    » We have strict legal, procedural, and ethical standards to reduce the risk of harm to any individuals.
  - Concern about bias or issues of inequality - e.g., “This effort/data is biased against my community” or “this effort will exacerbate societal inequalities,” and potential responses:
    » We recognize that some data may contain historic biases that can discriminate against or have serious impacts on our communities, and we are taking steps to ensure that we mitigate any such risks, such as conducting a disparate impact analysis.
    » Data can be a tool for revealing and addressing bias and discrimination that already exist in our community rather than a tool to exacerbate biases.
    » We have strict data quality standards and are working with leading domain experts, advocates, and community members to ensure our work respects their experiences.
  - Mistrust of institutions - e.g., “I don’t trust the government” or “this is just more from Big Brother,” and potential responses:
    » The IDS is an ____________ organization [within/outside of] or state/local government, with strict oversight and accountability mechanisms.
    » The IDS has no connection to federal agencies or other entities outside our state/local government.
    » We are engaging in robust public engagement and involvement activities to ensure that the IDS is driven by our community members’ priorities at every stage.

For more, see Nothing to Hide: Tools for Talking (and Listening) About Data Privacy for Integrated Data Systems.
Anticipate pushback to privacy protection efforts.

- Innovation – e.g., “This [privacy safeguard] will stifle innovation,” and potential responses:
  - Our IDS’ policies are designed to give us the best of both worlds, so that we can maximize innovative data uses while sustaining the public’s trust and protecting community members from harm.
  - Evidence shows that privacy protections play an important role in creating environments in which experimentation and innovation flourish.
  - Investing in appropriate privacy safeguards up front will build our community’s trust and save us time and resources later, supporting future innovation.
- Not my job – e.g., “I’m just a researcher/engineer/developer, I don’t control how the data is used,” and potential responses:
  - Protecting our community’s privacy is everyone’s responsibility. It is an important part of our IDS’ values and our roles as public servants.
  - Our IDS is committed to protecting our community members’ privacy by design and by default, and our technical and data experts are often our front-line responders to potential privacy risks.
- Nothing to hide/public data – e.g., “If you have nothing to hide, then you shouldn’t be concerned” or “But it’s all public information anyway,” and potential responses:
  - Privacy isn’t about “hiding” information about yourself, it’s about being in control of who has your information and what they can do with it. Even if you do not feel strongly about how your information is used, your data can have an impact on your friends, family members, neighborhood, and entire community.
  - Although administrative data is already being collected and used by public agencies, our IDS has a responsibility to protect the data and to consider additional risks that might arise when the data is combined in new ways.
- Resignation – e.g., “I lost my privacy long ago and my opinion won’t matter anyway” or “You don’t really expect me to read another privacy policy, do you?” and potential responses:
  - It’s important to our IDS that our community members know and approve of what we are doing with integrated data.
  - Instead of burying information in a privacy policy no one will read, we are committed to providing our community members with meaningful, inclusive public engagement and involvement with opportunities for everyone’s voice to be heard.
  - As a member of our community, your opinions about data and privacy are important to us and we want you to be a part of our decision-making processes by joining/doing ____________________.