The Current State of Kids’ and Teens’ Privacy
Future of Privacy Forum
November 7, 2023

Chloe Altieri
Policy Counsel for Youth and Education at FPF
Phyllis H. Marcus
Partner, Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP
The Children’s Privacy and Safety Landscape

Phyllis H. Marcus
Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP
(202) 955-1810
PMarcus@HuntonAK.com

November 7, 2023
Who Are the Actors?
Children’s Privacy and Safety Oversight

A highly fragmented set of laws, set by:

• U.S. States
• U.S. Federal Trade Commission
• U.S. Congress
State Design and Safety Codes
As of early August, at least 35 states had considered legislation in 2023 aimed at protecting children when they use the internet and social media.

Eleven states have already enacted such bills.
State Laws: A Complicated Landscape

Map: LexisNexis State Net • Source: National Conference of State Legislatures • Get the data • Created with Datawrapper
Platform Accountability Laws

- **Florida (SB 262)**
  - Prohibits:
    - Processing children’s PI if platform knows (or willfully disregards) that processing may result in substantial harm or privacy risk
    - Profiling a child unless appropriate safeguards and profiling is necessary/does not create risk
    - Collecting, sharing, selling PI unless compelling reason and doing so does not create risk
    - Geolocation restrictions
    - Dark patterns to encourage submission of PI

- **Louisiana (HB 61)**
  - Prohibits online services from allowing U18s to sign up for accounts without parental consent;
  - Allows parents to cancel the terms-of-service contracts their children signed for existing accounts;
  - Gives parents the ability to monitor their children's accounts;
  - Companies must prohibit adults from messaging minors with whom they aren’t already connected;
  - Prohibits use of targeted advertising (other than based on age and location);
  - Restricts PI collection
Age Verification Laws

• Arkansas SB 396
  • Requires minors to seek parental consent to open a social media account
  • Mandates that social media platforms verify account holder’s age.
  • Being challenged in *NetChoice v. Griffin* (PI granted Aug. 31)

• Texas HB 1181
  • Requires any website that publishes “sexual material harmful to minors” to verify users’ identities
  • Being challenged in *Free Speech Coalition v. Colmenero* (PI granted Aug. 31)

• Utah (SB 152)
  • Requires parental consent to minors’ use of social media and requires age verification government-issued ID

• Other states: Mississippi (S 2346); Louisiana (H 77); Montana (S 544); Virginia (S 1515)
Social Media Metering Laws

• Utah (SB 152)
  • Prohibits minors from accessing social media platforms between 10:30 pm and 6:30 am
California Age-Appropriate Design Code (AB 2733)

- Modeled on UK Code
- Covers CCPA-defined “businesses” providing online services, products, or features “likely to be accessed by children” under age 18

**Would require:**
- DPIA assessing use of children’s data and risks of material detriment (exposure, exploitation, contacts, algorithmic harms, targeted advertising, incentive/engagement features, sensitive PII collection)
- Age estimation of child users with “reasonable level of certainty appropriate to the risks” presented
- Transparency, age-appropriate language
- Configuring default privacy settings to high level of privacy
- Signaling to child when parental monitoring occurs
- Tools to exercise privacy rights

**Would prohibit:**
- Using kids’ PI in ways that could be materially detrimental to physical health, mental health, or child’s well-being
- Collecting, selling, sharing, retaining kids’ PI, or profiling a child by default unless can demonstrate “compelling” reason that doing so is in children’s best interests
- Collecting, selling, sharing precise geolocation information (and must provide an obvious sign to children)
- Dark patterns encouraging provision of PI (nudge techniques)

**Being challenged in NetChoice v. Bonta**
- Preliminary injunction granted September 18, 2023 (fails on First Amendment grounds, applying intermediate scrutiny)
- CA AG has filed an appeal

* At least 10 states have introduced bills modeled on California’s – First Amendment-proof?
Federal Trade Commission
Federal Trade Commission: Getting in on the Action?

• Stepped up COPPA Enforcement
  • Epic Games (Dec. 2022) ($275 mill. COPPA penalty)
  • Edmodo (May 2023) ($6 mill.)
  • Amazon Alexa (May 2023) ($25 mill.)
  • Microsoft Xbox (June 2023) ($20 mill.)

• Expanded general statutory authority
  • Epic Games (Dec. 2022) (dark patterns and billing practices)

• 2019 COPPA Rule Review
  • Proposed revised Rule forthcoming?
  • May have aspects of age-appropriate design codes
Federal Legislative Initiatives
Federal Legislative Initiatives

At the federal level, the Senate Commerce Committee voted out two bipartisan bills to protect children’s internet use in late July 2023:

• **COPPA 2.0 (Sen. Markey, Sen. Cassidy)**
  - Extends COPPA to kids under age 17
  - Defines personal information as that “reasonably linkable” to a child or teen
  - Expands knowledge to that “fairly implied on the basis of objective circumstances”
  - No requirement to age gate or collect any new PI to make this determination
  - Bans targeted advertising directed at minors

  - Aspects of CA AADC
  - Would require “covered platforms” to:
    - Act in the best interests of a user the platform “knows or reasonably should know is a minor” by taking reasonable measures to prevent and mitigate various harms
    - Limit who can communicate with minors and prevent others from viewing a minor’s personal data
    - Limit features encouraging minors to stay online for an extended period of time
    - Offer the ability to opt out of algorithms and limit the types of content with which a minor can interact
Pascale Raulin-Serrier
Senior Advisor in Digital Education and Coordinator DEWG, French CNIL
The current state of Kids’ and Teens’ Privacy
Future of Privacy Forum

Webinar on Tuesday 7 November 2023

Pascale RAULIN-SERRIER, Senior Advisor, CNIL & Coordinator of the International Digital Education Working Group, GPA
Protecting children in the digital ecosystem a priority for our data protection authorities

Mandate of European DPAs strengthened by the GDPR

Priority of the Global Privacy Assembly Strategic Plan

International cooperation strengthened by the Digital Education Working Group (DEWG)
INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION STRENGTHENED BY THE DIGITAL EDUCATION WORKING GROUP (DEWG)
Exploring attitudes towards using data rights at a panel of data protection authorities

Are you in favor of a greater recognition of the exercise of these digital rights by the children themselves?

- Yes, a "digital majority" should be defined, allowing minors to exercise these rights by themselves. (32%)
- Yes, but this "digital majority" must be defined and safeguards must be provided for the collection and processing of data concerning minors. (37%)
- Yes, but this recognition must always be done in collaboration with parents. (7%)
- No, the legal framework is satisfactory. (24%)
Adoption of an international Resolution on Children’s Digital Rights

43rd Closed Session of the Global Privacy Assembly
October 2021

Adopted Resolution on children's digital rights
Conduct international surveys

Informational good practices
Junior websites DPA &
ENOC Network:
Ombudsmen websites

18.05.2022

As part of the implementation of the GPA Resolution on Children’s Digital Rights adopted in October 2021, it is recommended to raise awareness and promote procedures accessible to young people and/or their parents that create trust in order to encourage them:

- Understand and exercise their privacy rights via online service platforms; and
- Refer to our data protection authorities directly in the process of complaints mechanisms or cooperation via mediation organisations, when platforms fail to respond to their requests or because the process for exercising their rights proves to be too complex and dissuasive.
Pooling resources on an online library

The Working Group on Digital Education was established under the Resolution on a Digital Education for all during the 35th International Conference of Data Protection and Privacy Commissioners. The group adopted a work programme to implement the operational objectives set in the Resolution. In this purpose, it took the lead in sharing digital education content and material collected from the Data Protection Authorities through the use of a common web platform.
Video from the CIL Burkina

Video used by Gibraltar from publicly available resources

Video from Norway « how do you want to be seen? »
Irish manual « Sign Up, Login Opt Out:
Protecting your Privacy &
Controlling Your Data »

Canadian graphic novel
Implementing the data protection Competency framework in national curricula

1. Personal data
2. Privacy, civil liberties and protection of personal data
3. Understanding the digital environment – technical aspects
4. Understanding the digital environment – economic aspects
5. Understanding personal data regulations and legislation
6. Understanding personal data regulation: Controlling the use of personal information
7. Managing my data: Learning to exercise my rights
8. Managing my data: Learning to protect myself online
9. The digital world: Becoming a digital Citizen
DEWG’s Work Plan 2023-2024

**Priority I:** Strengthen engagement with schools and teachers

**Priority II:** Support parents in developing their digital education skills and promote positive digital parenting

**Priority III:** Monitor progress on the digital inclusion of children

**Priority IV:** Urge for transparency of online service platforms, including EdTech

**Priority V:** Collaborate on Age Assurance issue

**Priority VI:** Explore AI systems in education regarding students’ rights over their data
Art 57(b) “Promote public awareness and understanding of the risks, rules, safeguards and rights in relation to processing. Activities addressed specifically to children shall receive specific attention”
Digital Services Act (DSA): zoom in on protection of minors online

- Internet access providers, domain name registries...
- Cloud services, webhosting...
- Social networks, online marketplaces, app stores, collaborative economy platforms, ...
- Online platforms and search engines (VLOP / VLOSE) with over 45 million users in the EU, designated by EC

**Art. 14** – for those primarily directed at minors, explanation of their terms and conditions easily understandable to minors.

**Art. 28** – all platforms accessible to minors:
- Measures to ensure privacy, safety and security of minors in the service
- EC empowered to issue guidelines
- **Prohibition to serve targeted ads** based on personal data when they have reasonable assurance the user is a minor
- No additional processing of personal data

**Art. 34 and 35** - Risk management regime for VLOPs/VLOSEs
- Identification of systemic risks, including negative impact on rights of the child, and protection of minors online
- Implementation of mitigation measures, targeted to the risk (such as parental control, age verification, etc.)
- Subject to independent audits
- COM primary enforcer
When will the new rules apply?

- **27 Oct 22**: Publication in OJ
- **16 Nov 22**: Entry into force
- **17 Feb 2023**: First designation of VLOPs/VLOSEs
  - 25 April 2023
  - + admin delay + 4 months
- **16 Nov 22**: Entry into application of obligations for designated VLOPs and VLOSEs
  - August / September 23
- **17 Feb 2024**: Latest date for MS to appoint Digital Service Coordinators (DSC)

Obligations apply to all services
DIGITAL EDUCATION : NATIONAL MATTER
Who is affected? Who are our targets?

- General Public
- Youth, parents and teachers
- Data controllers and processors

Are you looking for information or wish to submit a request online? Discover the “Besoin d’aide” (Need help) tool on cnil.fr (in French only)

CNIL.
The children, parents and teachers

Challenges to digital use, the risks involved

- The mass collection of information about their preferences, identity or lifestyle, highly coveted data

- Digital should not lock children into a system of predisposition or reinforce inequalities or digital divide

- Less aware and more exposed to risks online & inadequately supervised digital practices

- Risk of large-scale surveillance of children
CNIL published 8 recommendations to enhance the protection of children online in 2021

- Regulate the capacity of children to act online
- Strengthen the information and rights of children by design
- Encourage children and youth to exercise their rights
- Support for parents in the digital education of their children
- Provide specific safeguards to protect the interests of the child

with the aim of providing practical advice and on cnil.fr appropriate for all audiences (young people, parents and professionals)
Workshops for co-constructing ethical interfaces

Case Studies

Those case studies, co-created with the participants of the Données & Design workshops, illustrate ways of implementing the GDPR key concepts according to diverse use cases.
Demonstration of a privacy-preserving age verification process

Is it possible to prove that one is over the age of legal majority without sharing one’s age or identity? The LINC, Olivier Blazy, Ecole Polytechnique professor and cryptography researcher, and the Pôle d’Expertise de la Régulation Numérique (PEReN – Digital platform expertise for the public) developed a possible implementation of an age-verification system that allows accessing restricted websites without sharing other personally identifiable data.

https://linc.cnil.fr/demonstration-privacy-preserving-age-verification-process
PROMOTING DIGITAL EDUCATION & CHILDREN’S RIGHTS
Digital education, a strategic priority

- Partnership with the French Ministry of Education
- Scaling up to a multi-stakeholder approach
- Training of trainers in Digital Education
- Producing a wide range of resources for young people
A highly diverse Collective of stakeholders facilitated by CNIL from 2013

Some 70 non-profit organisations from the world of education and research, parent-teacher association, consumer associations, public media…

Concrete joint accomplishments and key actions: the Educnum Awards, an escape game on key issues, educational resources, position papers…
Education and training

https://www.cnil.fr/fr/enfants-et-ados

- Educate all audience to keep control of data
- Equip teachers with more qualified skills
Campaign “All together for a safe internet”

4 videos for children from 8-10

A card game

Leaflets for teachers and parents
Self-assessment of knowledge

Quiz

- Positioning test to find out where you stand with regard to your uses... and your knowledge of the protection of your personal data
  - Well done, you've got the right reflexes
  - Not bad, but you can still improve
  - You still have some way to go

Crée ton mot de passe: Q'EST-CE QUE JE VAIS CHOISIR ? ...
Poster for the classroom

- Glossary

  - What is the Internet anyway?
  - Is a social network easy to recognise?
  - Is a search engine the same as a browser?
  - Do I use IP addresses too?
  - What is a cookie?
  - What is it? Do I have a browsing history?
  - My personal data is private!
  - Even online, children have rights!

---

**Poster**

**EN LIGNE, SOYONS TOUS PRUDENTS !**

**Un moteur de recherche**

Un navigateur, bien qu’il s’agisse d’un programme informatique qui vous permet de parcourir internet, n’est pas un moteur de recherche. L’usage d’un moteur de recherche est destiné à chercher des informations sur Internet.

**Des adresses IP, j’en utilise, oui aussi !**

Votre navigateur peut être une association entre un navigateur Web et un accord entre des adresses IP. Il est possible d’utiliser des adresses IP pour se connecter à Internet.

**Un réseau social, c’est facile à responsabiliser ?**

Un réseau social est un partage d’informations entre plusieurs personnes via Internet. Le principe est de permettre à plusieurs personnes de se connecter à Internet pour partager des informations ou des idées.

**En ligne, les enfants ont des droits !**

En ligne, les enfants ont des droits ! La CNIL a émis des recommandations pour le comportement en ligne des enfants.

---

**Glossary**

- **What is the Internet anyway?**
- **Is a social network easy to recognise?**
- **Is a search engine the same as a browser?**
- **Do I use IP addresses too?**
- **What is a cookie?**
- **What is it? Do I have a browsing history?**
- **My personal data is private!**
- **Even online, children have rights!**

---

**CNIL.**

45
Playing to use your knowledge

» The Incollables® fan & interactive quiz with 3 levels of expertise

Thank you for your attention.

pserrer@cnil.fr
The children's code shows how to design data protection into online services so they're appropriate for children.

Code applies to “relevant information society services which are likely to be accessed by children” – aged under 18, in the UK.

It is a code of practice setting out 15 interlinked standards of age-appropriate design for online services which process children’s personal data.

The code is grounded in the provisions of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNRC), and creates an open, transparent and safer place for children to play, explore and learn online.

The standards in the code are rooted in existing data protection laws, introduced by the Data Protection Act (2018).
The code has 15 standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. Age appropriate application</td>
<td>8. Data minimisation</td>
<td>13. Nudge techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Detrimental use of data</td>
<td>10. Geolocation</td>
<td>15. Online tools</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ICO has been taking a wide-ranging approach to supervising the code

- Supervision activity – engagement & evidence gathering with 60+ companies, 6 ongoing investigations
- Voluntary auditing 10 organisations
- Age assurance project, inc international standards
- Engagement with co-regulators and government
- Policy development
How is industry responding?

Children’s code evaluation 2023 feedback from business:

- 87% feel that the code has improved data protection for children
- 72% understand the theory within the code
- 74% of business understand what conformance requires
- 27% made changes in 2022 to support conformance.
- 46% self-identifying as fully conformant in late 2022

Levelling off of awareness and changes in late 2022 / early 2023
Learning from supervision

- 80% of companies identified as either good or some improvement needed, 20% significant issues identified
- A lack of commitment to transparency.
- Challenges of how children can exercise their data privacy rights.
- Inadequate or non-existent age assurance or verification.
- Ongoing use of behavioural profiling linked to marketing, detrimental use of data and data sharing.
- Privacy information not in child friendly language.
- Nudge techniques to encourage lower protections.
- Insufficient risk assessments and DPIAs.
But companies are changing their approach

- Visible behaviour change from companies - targeted and personalised ads blocked for children and children’s accounts set to private by default plus location history turned off by default.

- Google turned off adds to under 18s and TikTok turned profiles for under 18s private by default; Snap, Instagram and Epic Games making improvements to parental controls; and Meta, Sony and Lego have started using age assurance systems to improve identification of under-aged accounts and to improve age appropriateness of content.
ICO resources available

ICO AADC materials: https://ico.org.uk/for-organisations/uk-gdpr-guidance-and-resources/childrens-information/childrens-code-guidance-and-resources/
ICO GDPR resources: https://ico.org.uk/for-organisations/uk-gdpr-guidance-and-resources/

Best interests of the child self-assessment | ICO
Age Assurance for the Children’s Code (ico.org.uk)
‘Likely to be accessed’ by children – FAQs, list of factors and case studies. | ICO
Children’s Code Self-Assessment Risk Tool | ICO
designing-data-transparency-for-children.pdf (ico.org.uk)
designing-data-transparency-for-children.pdf (ico.org.uk)